Circular and connectivity-ambiguous vs. non-circular and connectivityexplicit disease clusters –examples from Foot-and-Mouth Disease and Avian Influenza epidemics

Ariel L. Rivas, Steven N. Konah, Douglas J. Perkins Center for Global Health, Health Sciences Center, University of New Mexico, Albuquerque, NM 87131, USA, email: alrivas@unm.edu



London's water distribution map (used by John Snow in his 1855 studies) and some of his plots, which identified the source of the cholera epidemic (the pump), located *on the street* 

# Same message, one and a half century *later*



# Is "spatial" synonymous with "geographic"?



Geography is composed of numerous "layers." They create numerous MULTI-DIMENSIONAL relationships. "Spatial" is only one component of "geographic" –it is a bi-variate (X, Y) but uni-dimensional (one surface)



Host distribution

Geo-biological relationships are composed of numerous "layers", which create numerous MULTI-DIMENSIONAL relationships. Transmission across hosts does not consider geographic interactions.



Host distribution

# CLUSTERING (e.g., the STATIC housing structure)

Geo-biological relationships are composed of numerous "layers", which create numerous MULTI-DIMENSIONAL relationships. Transmission across hosts does not consider geographic interactions. Clustering does not consider rapidly changing dynamics.



Host distribution

#### CLUSTERING (e.g., the STATIC housing structure)

CONTACTS (the human or human/animal network)

Geo-biological relationships are composed of numerous "layers", which create numerous MULTI-DIMENSIONAL relationships. Transmission across hosts does not consider geographic interactions. Clustering does not consider rapidly changing dynamics. Contacts among susceptible and infected hosts provides information after the fact (too late).



Host distribution

# CLUSTERING (e.g., the STATIC housing structure)

CONTACTS (the human or human/animal network)

CONNECTIVITY (e.g., the road network)

Geo-biological relationships are composed of numerous "layers", which create numerous MULTI-DIMENSIONAL relationships. Transmission across hosts does not consider geographic interactions. Clustering does not consider rapidly changing dynamics. Contacts among susceptible and infected hosts provides information after the fact (too late). Connectivity provides information on a pre-existing network.

### The 2007 British FMD epidemic – the role of CONNECTIVITY

The press reported the association between connectivity and epidemic spread.

#### Source:

http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/ hi/uk\_news/6990913.st m



 The 2007 British FMD epidemic took place in a highly urbanized area, where road density was high



 The 2007 British FMD epidemic took place in a highly urbanized area, where road density was high



 The 2007 British FMD epidemic took place in a highly urbanized area, where road density was high





# Source: BBC

[http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/uk\_news/6990913.stm]



# Were all cases equal?



Not all cases were homogeneously distributed over space: those closer to roads (and road intersections) were clustered.

# Was that structure unique?

 FMD and Avian Influenza epidemics in environments where 100% of the population's members were susceptible (exotic epidemics)

# More FMD epidemics

• Uruguay, 2001



# Most cases were located close to road intersections



Cases were also associated with farm size: smaller farms predominated near road intersections



Roads, road intersections, cases, and location size (farms) were neither randomly nor homogeneously distributed



The 2006 Nigerian H5 N1 Avian Influenza epidemic 57.5% of all infected farms (65/113) were <19.3 km from a road intersection





- All cases by epidemic week 24 (113 cases) 0 Epidemic nodes at 1, 2 days Epidemic nodes at 3, 4 days Epidemic nodes at 5-180 days ∧ / Major road network

  - Nigeria



Infected farms [n=65] within 31 km from road intersections

- <1.59 km to nearest road 0
- 1.59-3.23 0
- 3.23-5.84  $\bigcirc$
- 5.84-10.60  $\bigcirc$
- 10.60-19.30
- Other infected farms [n=48]
- / Major road network
- Nigeria (partial view)

# Are all epidemic cases equal?

Apparently not.

Instead of building control zones of identical radius (an assumption based on the hypothesis that all cases are equal), we could consider the actual *CONNECTING NETWORK*.